

IRSTI 17.01.21

Sultan Khan Akkuly, Sagymbay Zhumagul, Kaiyrbek Kemengger

L.N. Gumilyov Eurasian National University, Nur-Sultan, Kazakhstan

(E-mail: *praha2002@mail.ru*)

New facts about the famine in Alash's spiritual heritage

(1932-33 years)

Abstract. As a consequence of intentional extermination of Kazakhs by means of famine of 1932-1933, the population decreased from more than 7 million people to barely 2 million. Due to its scale and characteristics this thoroughly planned action can only be referred to as ethnocide according to the definition of the UN as a «policy of destruction of an ethnic or national identity, the self-awareness of a people.»

The information brought forward by Alikhan Bukeikhan exposes the inveracity of the Soviet statistics on population of the Kazakh people before and after the famine of 1932-1933 and reveals the true extent of the national disaster of the Kazakh people, which reduced their population from 7.2 million people to less than 2 million. This information possessed by the Kazakh national leader became available only recently.

Keywords: Kazakhs, repression, 8-9 million, hunger, 2,1 million, ethnocide, genocide

DOI: <https://doi.org/10.32523/2616-678X-2019-127-2-15-21>

Introduction. To this day there exists no common opinion among the Kazakh historians and demographers, not only about the number of victims of the famine of 1932-1933, but also about the population of Kazakhs before the man-made tragedy took place. It is important to emphasize that all contradictions concerning the relatively accurate number of victims of the national disaster occurred due to the lack of, or to be more precise - due to the concealment of reliable statistical data about the actual population of Kazakhs prior to the famine. A considerable contribution to these contradictions is made most often intentionally by scientists from the neighboring Russia, who politicize the topic and attempt to refute the research of Kazakh historians and demographers of the 1990s and lower the number of Kazakhs who perished and those who migrated to neighboring countries due to hunger, relying only on the official statistical data of the Soviet government. For example, A. N. Alexeyenko states, that «considering all possible corrections, the loss of the Kazakh population amounted to not more than 1,840 thousand people or 47.3% of the population of the ethnic group in 1930» [1], thereby expressing a disagreement with numbers declared to the public by a Kazakh demographer, M. B. Tatimov about 2,020 thousand dead and 616 thousand people who permanently migrated [2] and by a historian, Kh. M. Asylbekov about 2.5 million dead and 616 thousand people who permanently migrated (a total of: 3,116 thousand people) [3].

It is no longer a secret that the USSR government intentionally lowered the losses of population due to famine, especially in Kazakhstan and Ukraine. The actual indigenous population of Kazakhstan - i.e. the Kazakhs has been distorted prior to and after the famine - «asharshylyk («ашаршылық») of 1932-1933. For example, after the census of 1937 J. Stalin found that the population suffered a decrease instead of an increase. Expressing indignation and distrust towards the result of the census, Stalin ordered to classify the census data and declared all people who participated in its drafting, enemies of the state.

Therefore, with regards to the official data, according to the National Population Census of the USSR of 1926, the number of Kazakhs amounted to 3,968,289 people [4], however according to the census of 1939 - only 3,100,949 people [5].

Meanwhile, both Kazakh and Russian scientists continue to base their work on this data in their research and when determining the number of victims of the Kazakh famine - «ашаршылық» of 1932-1933, ignorant of or simply ignoring the data gathered by Kazakh national leaders in the

beginning of the XX century, the essays of whom, dedicated to this issue especially in the Kazakh language remained unavailable to the scientific circle up until the beginning of the 90s of the previous century, as well as the statistical data of the February Revolution of 1917. In order to confirm the unreliability (to put it mildly) of the official Soviet statistics, it is sufficient to see the results of the first general population census of the Russian Empire of 1897 [6]. In their research, the Kazakh elite «Alash,» particularly the leader of the Kazakh National Liberation Movement «Alash» at the beginning of the XX century, Alikhan Bukeikhan relied precisely on the results of the first census.

A.N. Bukeikhan's research about the Kazakh population is of immense scientific value, first of all because he was an eyewitness and a direct participant of the first general population census of the Russian Empire of 1897 in the Kazakh steppe region. Second of all, A. N. Bukeikhan having participated in the expedition of 1896-1901 organized by the Ministry of Agriculture and State Property of the Russian Empire and lead by F. A. Shcherbina, who was researching the Kazakh population and its households in 3 steppe regions of Kazakhstan, as well as in the scientific expedition lead by S.P. Shvetsov for an economic assessment of the regions of the Siberian railway, was rightly considered the best expert on Kazakhstan prior to and after the Revolution of 1917.

The invitation to join the Special Committee for Research of Soviet and Autonomous Republics of the Academy of Sciences of USSR as an expert on Kazakhstan in 1926 by the Presidium of the Academy, as well as his direct involvement as one of the leaders of the anthropological expedition of the AS of USSR which produced a study of the socio-economic state of the Aday Uyezd of Kazakhstan act as additional evidence of this fact.

We shall only add that the leader of the Kazakh National Liberation Movement «Alash,» starting from 1897 thoroughly kept track of the dynamics of the growth and population of his people, periodically publishing his research and calculations in the said matter in the periodical print and scientific collections.

It is possible to contrast and compare the reliability and objectivity of not only the results of the All-Russian Census of 1897, 1926, 1937 and 1939, but the results and calculations of the Kazakh population made by scientists of the period before and after the February Revolution of 1917 as well, namely the modern Russian scientist, A. N. Alexeenko and the Kazakh leader of the beginning of the XX century, A. N. Bukeikhan.

Thus, the population of people, who whose native language was Kazakh, according to the results of the first General Population Census of the Autocratic Russia of 1897 equaled to 4,080 thousand [7]. However, even this data about the Kazakh population proved to be not entirely objective.

Since, as was emphasized in the statement of a group of Kazakh intelligentsia lead by A. N. Bukeikhan directed at the Kazakh population of the Turgay Region under the headline «To the Kazakh People!» («Қазақ халқына!»), published in the June issue of 1917 of the «Kazakh» («Қазақ») newspaper concerning the coming population census, in the course of the first general census of 1897 and the repeated census of the population of the Kokshetau Uyezd in 1907 - 10 years later, the Kazakh people concealed or understated the number of their children of pre-conscription and conscription age due to suspicion and fear that «the census is conducted for the purposes of revealing the number of Kazakh children for drafting them into service in the Russian Army». A considerable amount of Kazakh families simply migrated deep into the steppes to avoid the census.

«The concealment of the number of children during census for fear of drafting into the army as before will cause more harm than good since the number of Members of Parliament of each people in the Constitutional Convention will depend directly on the population of the people. If Kazakhs understate the actual value of the population of male and female genders, then the number of Members of Parliament will be set accordingly. To fear that Kazakhs will be forced to serve in the military and to understate the age of one's children is foolish as well. To conceal one's children now as before is inadmissible» [8] the Kazakh national leaders declared in their statement to the citizens of Alash.

In turn, A. Bukeikhan in his historical essay «The Kazakhs» (in the original «The Kyrgyz»), calculated the increase in the population of Kazakhs in 1910 to 4,696,6009 on the basis of the official results of this census. It is important to note that, for greater accuracy of his calculations and in order to avoid suspicions of an intentional exaggeration of the actual number of his people, he based his calculations on the lowest possible coefficient of natural population growth, i.e. 1.55, whereas the growth coefficient of nomadic Kazakhs, for example, in the Turgay Region equaled to 2.5.

Considering these nuances, it may be safe to assume that in reality, in 1910 the population of Kazakhs considerably exceeded 5 million people. Such an estimate is fully confirmed in another note of A. N. Bukeikhan, published in 1924 in the «The Working Kazakh» («Еңбекші қазақ»), the official party-and-state administrative body of the Kazakh ASSR, where the author asserted: **«In 1914 the total population of Russia equaled to 161 million 700 thousand people. How many Kazakhs were there that year? In 1896, and in 1907, i.e. ten years later, the Kazakhs of the Kokshetau Uyezd were counted twice. If one was to compare these numbers, then it follows that the growth dynamics of the Kazakh people noticeably surpassed the worldwide dynamics. If each year three people are added to every two hundred Kazakhs on average, then towards the year 1914 the population of Kazakhs must have been 6 million 470 (!) people.»** [10]

A simple comparison of this data with the official results of the population censuses of 1926 and 1939, as well as the calculations of Russian scientists, particularly A. N. Alexeyenko invokes a complete perplexity. According to the results of the census of 1926 conducted 12 years after the census of 1914, throughout the whole territory of the USSR the Kazakh population due to some peculiar circumstances did not increase, but on the contrary, decreased and became even less than 4 million - 3,968,289 people, whereas according to natural growth dynamics of Kazakhs, this number should have exceeded 7 million. Even when taking casualties of the brutal quelling of the Kazakh uprising of 1916, the Civil War of 1917-1919, migration into the neighboring countries as well as the famine of 1921-1922 into consideration, the population of Kazakhs should have amounted to not fewer than 6-6.5 million. Where did the other 2-2.5 million disappear to?

The Russian scientist A. N. Alexeyenko does not especially trouble himself with searching for an answer to such a question. Instead, due to reasons only he understood, he distorted the already unreliable data of the 1926 census and diminished the population of Kazakhs from 3,968,289 to 3,718,000, i. e. by 250 thousand people. On top of that, A. N. Alexeyenko, a modern apologist of the 1926-1939 censuses, probably intentionally erred in his calculations, applying the lowest coefficient of population growth per year to Kazakhs, expressed as 1.5. **«In the pre-crisis year of 1930 the population of the Kazakh ethnic group»** he states, **«according to my calculations should have amounted to 3886 thousand (at the beginning of the year). The calculations were based on the following. The population of the ethnic group according to the data of the 1926 census (with all amendments) was determined to be 3,718 thousand people. Taking natural growth over the course of three years (4,5% between 1927-1929) into consideration, we get a total of 3886 thousand.»** [11].

A.N. Bukeikhan's calculations mentioned in the above note, seem much more objective and realistic. It is necessary to stress, that the Kazakh leader published this note when he was in a forced exile in Moscow, precisely for the purpose of exposing the unreliability, if not intentional distortion allowed by the communist government of Kazakhstan. According to his estimate, the natural increase of the Kazakh population during the course of 10 years, from the beginning of World War I, composed of 979 thousand people. [12] However during the same period, some factors took place which negatively impacted first and foremost the population and growth of the natives, such as the cholera epidemic of 1917 in Turkestan, of 1921 in Kazakhstan and the famine of 1921-1922, all of which A. N. Bukeikhan listed in his note.

We will remind the reader that Kazakhstan was as a matter of fact, divided into the Kazakh and Turkestan ASSRs until October 1924, where the epidemic, economic devastation, war and famine, as A. N. Bukeikhan stated in his note in «The Working Kazakh,» cancelled out the natural

A more objective, if only approximate, number of victims of the famine of 1932-1933 can be determined by the «repressed census» of 1937, according to the official data of which - 4 years after the nation-wide disaster - the number of Kazakhs amounted to 2 million 181 thousand 520 people [14]. If the number of surviving Kazakhs is deduced from the total population of Kazakhs at the beginning of 1932 and exclude the average number of Kazakhs who migrated to the neighboring countries amounting to 1 million, then the most probable number of Kazakhs intentionally exterminated by famine.... **is 4 million 68 thousand 480 people.**

In conclusion, it remains to be added, that the Kazakh nation, having a population of more than 7 million people, being the 5th largest nation in the Russian Empire and USSR and the largest nation of all Central Asia until 1932, consisted of less than 2 million after 1933, forever losing more than 5 million and 68 thousand people, 4 million or 70% of the total population of which were physically exterminated, barely reaching 2 million 181 thousand 520 people in 1937.

It is no longer important whether to label the so-called national policy of the Soviet rule in Kazakhstan, which placed Kazakhs on the verge of complete physical extermination on their indigenous lands - as genocide or ethnocide. This national disaster of the Kazakh nation is by far larger and more tragic than the Ukrainian «**Holodomor**» which became an international term, accurately depicting the significance and scale of the tragedy of the Ukrainian nation. The national disaster in Kazakhstan of 1932-1933 is called «Asharshylyk» («**ашаршылық**») and there is no international term or conception, which accurately characterizes the tragedy that fell onto the long-suffering Kazakh nation.

Әдебиеттер тізімі

- 1 1926-39 жылдар аралығындағы Қазақстан халқының саны. / Құрастырған: В.Н. Владимиров // Компьютерлік және тарихи демография - Барнаул, 2000, - 210 б.
- 2 Тәтімов М.Б. Демографиялық процестердің әлеуметтік шарттығы. / М.Б. Тәтімов - Алматы, 1989. - 124 б.
- 3 Асылбеков, М.Х. Сыртқы көші-қон және оның XX ғасырдағы Қазақстанның ұлттық құрылымына ықпалы // Отандық тарих сабақтары және қазақ қоғамының қайта өрлеуі: Ұлттық бірлік пен ұлттық тарих жылына арналған Ғылым академиясының ғылыми сессияларының материалдары. - Алматы: Фолиант, 1999. - 263 б.
- 4 КСРО-ның 1926 жылғы халық санағы. - Москва: КСРО Орталық статистикалық басқармасы, - Москва, 1929. - 324 б.
- 5 КСРО халық санағы 1939 // КСРО республикаларында халық санының құрамы. – Москва: «Экономика университеті» ұлттық зерттеу университетінің Демография институты, 2011. - 425 б.
- 6 Трениницкий Н. 1897 жылғы Ресей империясының алғашқы жалпы халық санағы. // Империяның бүкіл аумағында 01.28.1897 өткізілген Бірінші жалпы халық санағының деректерін өңдеу нәтижелерінің жиынтықтығы. - Санкт-Петербург, 1905 жыл.
- 7 Бөкейхан Н. «Қырғыз». / Редакциясын басқарған: А.Н. Костелийский // Қазіргі ұлттардағы ұлттық қозғалыс формалары. - Санкт-Петербург, 1910. - 577 б.
- 8 Бөкейхан А., Байтұрсынов А., Дулатов М. Қазақ халқына! (Санақ туралы). // Қазақ, № 234, 24 маусым, 1917.
- 9 Бөкейхан Әлихан. 7 томдық толық жинағы. / Әлихан Бөкейхан Том III - Астана: «Сарыарқа» баспасы, 2009. - 283 б.
- 10 Бөкейхан Әлихан. Қанша қазақстандықтар? // Жұмысшы қазақ, 28 қазан, 1924 жыл.
- 11 1937 жылғы бүкіл халықтық санақ: жалпы нәтижелер. // Құжаттар мен материалдар жинағы. - Москва: Ресейлік саяси энциклопедия (ROSSPEN), 2007. - 320 б.

Сұлтан Хан Аққұлы, Сағымбай Жұмағұл, Қайырбек Кемеңгер

Л.Н. Гумилев ат. Еуразия ұлттық университеті, Нұр-Сұлтан, Қазақстан

Алаштың рухани мұрасындағы ашаршылық туралы тың деректер

(1932-33 жылдар)

Андатпа. 1932-1933 жылдардағы ашаршылықта қазақ халқын қасақана жою нәтижесі адам санын 7 миллионнан 2 миллионға дейін азайтты. Ол масштабы мен сипаттамасына қарай БҰҰ-ның «Этникалық немесе ұлттық бірегейлікті, халықтың өзін-өзі тануын жою саясаты» деген өлшеміне сәйкес келеді.

Әлихан Бөкейханның дерегі бойынша 1932-1933 жылдардағы ашаршылық бұрынғы және кейінгі қазақ халқы туралы кеңестік статистиканың қисынсыздығын көрсетеді, сондай-ақ қазақ халқының 7,2 миллионнан 2 миллионға дейін азайғанына дәлел болып отыр. Алаш ұлттық көшбасшысының бұл ақпараты жалпы көпшілікке енді ғана жетіп отыр.

Түйін сөздер: қазақтар, репрессия, 8-9 миллион, аштық, ашаршылық, 2,1 миллион, этноцид, геноцид.

Султан Хан Аккулы, Сағымбай Жумагул, Кайырбек Кемеңгер

Евразийский национальный университет им. Гумилева, Нур-Султан, Казахстан

Новые данные о голодоморе в идеологических наследиях Алаша (1932-33 годы)

Аннотация. В результате преднамеренного истребления казахов голодомором 1932-1933 годов население сократилось с более чем 7 миллионов человек до почти 2 миллионов. Благодаря своим масштабам и характеристикам, это тщательно спланированное действие можно назвать этноцидом только в соответствии с определением ООН как «политики уничтожения этнической или национальной идентичности, самосознания народа».

Информация, представленная Алиханом Букейханом, разоблачает неточность советской статистики по населению казахов до и после голода 1932-1933 годов и показывает истинные масштабы национального бедствия казахского народа, которое сократило его население с 7,2 миллиона человек менее 2 миллионов. Эта информация, которой обладает признанный лидер «Алаша», стала доступной только недавно.

Ключевые слова: казахи, репрессии, 8-9 миллионов, голод, 2,1 миллиона, этноцид, геноцид

References

- 1 1926-39 жылдар аралығындағы Қазақстан халқының саны, / Edited by V.N. Vladimirov // Компьютерлік және тарихи демография [The Population of Kazakhstan in the Years Between 1926-39], (Computer and Historical Demographics, Barnaul, 2000, 210 p.).
- 2 Tatimov, M. B. Демографиялық процестердің әлеуметтік шарттығы [Social Conditionality of Demographic Processes], (Alma-Ata, 1989, 124 p.).
- 3 Asylbekov, M.Kh. Сыртқы көші-қон және оның XX ғасырдағы Қазақстанның ұлттық құрылымына ірпалы [External Migration and its Impacts on the National Structure of Kazakhstan in XX Century], Отандық тарих сабақтары және қазақ қоғамының қайта өрлеуі: Ұлттық бірлік пен ұлттық тарих жылна арналған Ғылым академиясының ғылыми сессияларының материалдары [Lessons on Domestic History and Revival of the Kazakh Society: Materials of the Scientific Sessions of the Academy of Sciences for the National Unity and the Year of the National History], (Foliant, Almaty, 1998, 263 p.).
- 4 KSRO-ның 1926 жылғы халық санағы: KSRO Орталық статистикалық басқармасы [All-USSR Population

Census of 1926, Published by the Central Statistical Directorate of USSR], (Moscow, 1929, 324 p.).
5 KSRO-ның 1939 жылғы халық санағы: KSRO Орталық республикаларында халықтың құрамы [All-USSR population census of 1939: Composition of Nationalities within the Population in the Republics of USSR], «Экономика университеті» ұлттық зерттеу университетінің демография институты [The Institute of Demography of the National University of Research «University of Economics»], (Moscow, 2011, 425 p.).

6 Тренінский, Н. 1897 жылғы Ресей империясының алғашқы жалпы халық санағы [The First General Population Census of the Russian Empire of 1897], Империяның бүкіл аумағында 01.28.1897 өткізілген Бірінші жалпы халық санағының деректерін өңдеу нәтижелерінің жинағы [Total Combination of Results of Data Processing of the First General Population Census, conducted 01.28.1897 throughout the Empire], (St. Petersburg, 1905, 425 p.).

7 Бөкейхан, Н. Қырғыз [The Kyrgyz], Редакциясын басқарған: А.Н. Костелийский [Editorial Office A.N. Kosteliyskiy], Қазіргі ұлттардағы ұлттық қозғалыс формалары [The Forms of National Movement in Modern Nations], (St. Petersburg, 1910, 577 p.).

8 Бөкейхан А., Байтұрсынұлы А., Дүлатов М. Қазақ халқына! (Санақ туралы) [To the Kazakh People! (Concerning the census)], Қазақ [The Kazakh], 234, 06.24.1917.

9 Бөкейхан Әліхан. 7 томдық жинағының толық жинағы [The Complete Collection of Works in 7 volumes], III, «Сарыарқа» баспасы [Saryarka Publishing House], (Astana, 2009, 283 p.).

10 Бөкейхан, Әліхан. Қанша қазақстандықтар? [How Many Kazakhs?], Жұмысшы қазақ [The Working Kazakh], 10.28.1924.

11 1937 жылғы бүкіл халықтық санақ: жалпы нәтижелер . // Құжаттар мен материалдар жинағы [Collection of Documents and Materials], Ресейлік саяси энциклопедия (РОСПЕН) [The Russian Political Encyclopedia (ROSSPEN)], (Moscow, 2007, 320 p.).

Мақала BR05236848 бағдарламалық мақсатты қаржыландыру жобасы және
AP05132901 гранттық жобасы аясында жарияланып отыр,
Настоящая статья написана в рамках реализации программно-целевого
финансирования BR05236848 и грантового проекта AP05132901,

Авторлар туралы мәлімет:

Аққұлы Сұлтан Хан – филология ғылымдарының кандидаты, «Алаш» ғылыми-зерттеу институтының директоры, Нұр-Сұлтан, Қазақстан.

Жұмағұл Сағымбай – филология ғылымдарының докторы, профессор. Л.Н. Гумилев ат. Еуразия ұлттық университеті, Нұр-Сұлтан, Қазақстан.

Кемеңгер Қайырбек – филология ғылымдарының кандидаты, доцент. Л.Н. Гумилев ат. Еуразия ұлттық университеті, Нұр-Сұлтан, Қазақстан.

Akkuly Sultan Khan - PhD, Director of the Scientific Research Institution «Alash», L.N. Gumilyov Eurasian National University, Nur-Sultan, Kazakhstan.

Zhumagulov Sagymbay - Doctor of Philology, Professor, L.N. Gumilyov Eurasian National University, Nur-Sultan, Kazakhstan.

Kemengger Kaiyrbek - PhD, Professor of the Scientific Research Institution «Alash», L.N. Gumilyov Eurasian National University, Nur-Sultan, Kazakhstan.